# SOME ASPECTS OF THE STRUCTURAL RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN "MESSBACH-TYPE" AND "LUCIN-TYPE" VARISCITES 

P. Salvador Salvador, Instituto "Lucas Mallada", Sección de Mineralogía, C.S.I.C., Castellana, 84 Madrid-6, Spain

AND
J. Fayos, Instituto de Química Física "Rocasolano", Departamento
de Rayos X., C.S.I.C., Serrano, 119. Madrid-6, Spain

## Abstract

A comparative structural study of "Lucin-type" (VL) and "Messbach-type" (VM) variscites by X-ray diffraction and infrared spectroscopy has been performed.

Like "Lucin-type", "Messbach-type" variscite crystallizes in the orthorhombic system, probably with the same space group Pcab. The lattice constants found for VM: $a, 9.90_{2}, b, 9.65_{\mathrm{o}}, c, 17.18_{0} \AA$ are, however, sufficiently different from those assigned to VL ( $a, 9.83_{1} b, 9.63_{\mathrm{s}}, c, 8.55_{\mathrm{J}} \AA$ ), as to presume the existence of net structural differences. Infrared spectra support this assumption showing the existence of two different types of water molecules, which are present in both structures in different proportion. Some differences in the symmetry of $\mathrm{PO}_{4}{ }^{3-}$ anions between both variscite types were also found.

## Introduction

From X-ray, TDA, TGA, and infrared data of a great number of $\mathrm{AlPO}_{4} \cdot 2 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ natural samples from several localities, Čech and Slánský $(1965,1968)$ conclude that such a compound occurs in nature under three modifications: monoclinic metavariscite (syn. "clinovariscite"), orthorhombic variscite (Lucin-type), and variscite Messbach-type (syn. "redondite", "tangeite" and "peganite"). The symmetry of Metavariscite is $P 2_{1} / n$ and its structure has been studied by Borensztajn (1966), Fanfani and Zanazzi (1966), and Moore (1966). Lucin-type variscite symmetry is Pcab (Strunz, 1957) and it is considered isostructural with scorodite $\left(\mathrm{Fe} \mathrm{AsO}_{4} \cdot 2 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}\right)$, which structure was determined by Kyriyama and Sakurai (1949). The symmetry and unit cell of the latter modification is hitherto unknown, although its X-ray powder pattern and infrared spectrum show a close resemblance to the Lucin-type variscite, suggesting the existence of a close structural relationship between them.

The purpose of the present paper is to investigate the structural differences between both variscite types, in the light of X-ray powder diffraction and infrared spectrum analysis.

## Materlals

The samples used in this work occur from Palazuelo de las Cuevas, Zamora (Spain). A previous study of this mineral deposit made by Arribas et al. (1971), revealed that they are contaminated with metavariscite ( 15 percent for VL and 7 percent for VM) and with a small quantity of $\alpha$-quartz. Electron probe microanalysis showed the presence of small quantities of $\mathrm{Fe}, \mathrm{Cr}, \mathrm{Cu}$, and Ni in substitution for Al (VL sample: Fe $0.26, \mathrm{Cr} 0.26, \mathrm{Cu} 0.02$, Ni 0.03 percent. VM sample: Fe 0.12 , $\mathrm{Cr} 0.08, \mathrm{Cu} 0.11, \mathrm{Ni} 0.04$ percent).

## Results and Discussion

## X-ray diffraction

Despite the similarity between VM and VL X-ray patterns, the cell constants obtained by adjusting VL parameters to the VM diffractogram, do not allow a complete indexing ${ }^{-1}$. After different attempts based on trial and error methods, we concluded that this is only possible by duplicating the unit cell dimensions along $c$ axis. Table 1 shows the parameter so obtained. Those corresponding to the VI, cell are added for comparison. Indexed VL and VM diagrama are given in Table 2. Contamination of metavariscite (M) and $\alpha$-quartz (Q) was taken into account for VM diagram.

TABLE 1: UNIT CELL DATA FOR LUCIN AND MESSBACH TYPE VARISCITES

|  | vL | vM |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| a ( $\AA$ ) | $9.83_{1}$ | $9.90_{2}$ |
| b (R) | $9.63_{5}$ | 9.659 |
| c ( $R$ ) | $8.55_{5}$ | 17.180 |
| a:b:c | $1.020: 1: 0.888$ | $1.025: 1: 1.779$ |
| Cell. vol. $\left(\AA^{3}\right)$ | 810.34 | 1672.99 |
| Sp.9. (Calc) | $2.58^{\mathrm{a}}$ | $2.50^{\mathrm{a}}$ |
| Molecules per asym, unit | 1 | 2 |
| Space group | Pcab | Pcab |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ Experimental values go from 2,2 to 2,6 (Palache, Berman and Frondel, 1944).
Because of the VM diagram complexity, assignment of the space group is rather difficult. However, attending to the analysis of the systematic extinctions among isolated reflexions, the $P c a b$ space group seems to be probable.

[^0]Table 2. Indexed X-ray Powder Diffractograms for Lucin and Messbach Type Variscites.

| VM |  |  |  | VL |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| h k 1 | dcal | dobs | Ir | h k |  | deal | dobs | Ir |
| 012 | 6.419 |  |  | 11 |  | 5.358 | 5.356 | 72 |
| 111 | 6.413 | 6.408 | 8 | 20 | 0 | 4.908 | 4.904 |  |
| M |  | 6.32 | 3 | 02 | 0 | 4.810 | 4.810 | 30 |
| 112 | 5.385 | 5.387 | 61 | 00 |  | 4.280 | 4.26 | 65 |
| 020 | 4.831 | 4.831 | 47 | 20 |  | 4.257 | 4.26 | 65 |
| 201 M | 4.755 | 4.753 | 5 | 01 | 2 | 3.910 | 3.904 | 28 |
| $113^{M}$ | 4.410 | 4.54 | 3 | 12 | 1 | 3.856 | 3.856 | 4 |
| 210 | 4.404 | 4.407 | 47 | 11 | 2 | 3.632 | 3.633 | 18 |
| 004 | 4.294 |  |  | 22 | 0 | 3.435 | 3.437 | 2 |
| 202 | 4.288 | 4.290 | 100 | 20 | 2 | 3.225 | 3.226 | 8 |
| M |  | 4.23 | 4 | 02 | 2 | 3.197 | 3.192 | 8 |
| ${ }_{0} 114$ | 3.924 | 3.920 | 27 | 22 |  | 3.188 | 3.1047 | 100 |
| $\begin{array}{lll}2 & 1 & 2 \\ 1 & 2 & 2\end{array}$ | 3.918 3.874 | 3.872 | 27 | 12 | 2 | 3.040 2.913 | 3.041 2.914 | 100 |
| 203 | 3.743 | 3.742 | 15 | 13 | 1 | 2.871 | 2.873 | 39 |
| 114 | 3.647 | 3.650 | 11 | 32 | 0 | 2.705 | 2.703 | 26 |
| 213 M | 3.491 | 3.490 | 5 | 11 | 3 | 2.635 | 2.635 | 14 |
| 123 | 3.459 | 3.459 | 31 | 32 | 1 | 2.579 | 2.580 | 8 |
| 220 | 3.455 | 3.34 | 6 | $\bigcirc$ | 1 | 2.566 | 2.567 | 6 |
| 024 | 3.210 |  |  | 13 |  | 2.483 | 2.483 | 22 |
| 222 | 3.204 | 3.208 | 10 | 20 | 3 | 2.466 | 2.467 | 7 |
| 115 | 3.076 |  |  | 40 | 0 | 2.454 | 2.455 | 16 |
| 214 | 3.073 | 3.075 | 4 | 21 | 3 | 2.389 | 2.389 | 4 |
| 311 | 3.070 |  |  | 12 | 3 | 2.381 | 2.381 | 2 |
| 124 | 3.052 | 3.054 | 41 | 40 | 1 | 2.359 | 2.360 | 1 |
| 312 | 2.933 | 2.935 | 14 | 14 | 0 | 2.336 | 2.336 | 12 |
| 132 | 2.884 | 2.885 | 23 | 41 | 1 | 2.291 | 2.290 | 5 |
| 313 | 2.740 | 2.740 | 31 | 33 | 2 | 2.287 | 2.290 | 5 |
| 133 M | 2.699 | 2.700 | 45 | 23 | 2 | 2.274 | 2.275 | 4 |
| 230 | 2.698 | 2.700 | 45 | 33 | 1 | 2.212 | 2.213 | 2 |
| 125 | 2.693 | 2.693 | 8 | 2 2 | 43 | 2.195 2.160 | 2.197 2.160 | 2 |
| $\begin{array}{lll}2 & 2 \\ 1 & 1 \\ 1 & 6\end{array}$ | 2.692 2.644 | 2.645 | 7 | 2 0 | 40 4 4 | 2.160 2.140 | 2.160 2.139 | 3 5 |
| 322 | 2.597 | 2:597 | 4 | 42 | 1 | 2.118 | 2.119 | 3 |
| 034 M | 2.576 |  |  | 31 | 13 | 2.098 | 2.098 | 2 |
| 232 M | 2.573 | 2.575 | 9 | 04 | 42 | 2.097 | 2.098 | 2 |
| 134 M | 2.493 | 2.493 | 10 | 24 | 41 | 2.094 | 2.094 | 4 |
| 206 | 2.478 |  |  | 13 | 3 | 2.083 | 2.084 | 12 |
| 400 | 2.472 | 2.475 | 18 | 14 | 42 | 2.050 | 2.051 | 4 |
| 401 | 2.448 | 2.449 | 5 | 33 | 32 | 2.019 | 2.020 | 5 |
| 040 | 2.415 | 2.415 | 3 | 32 | 3 | 1.963 | 1.960 | 5 |
| 216 M | 2.399 | 2.400 | 9 | 20 | 4 | 1.961 | 1.960 |  |
| 035 | 2.349 | 2.347 | 5 | 23 | 33 | 1.955 | 1.955 | 5 |
| 140 | 2.345 | 2.347 | 5 | 02 | 2 | 1.955 | 1.95 | 8 |
| 042 | 2.325 | 2.325 | 11 | 42 | 22 | 1.947 | 1.947 | 8 |
| 141 | 2.324 | 2.325 | 11 | 24 | 42 | 1.928 | 1.928 | 2 |
| 117 | 2.312 | 2.312 | 7 | 21 | 14 | 1.922 | 1.921 | 5 |
| 315 | 2.310 | 2.312 | 7 | 12 | 24 | 1.917 | 1.917 | 8 |
| $\begin{array}{llll}1 & 3 & 5 \\ 2 & 4\end{array}$ | 2.286 2.283 |  | 4 | 43 | 31 | 1.900 | 1.900 | 2 |
| 331 | 2.283 | 2.285 | 4 | 40 | 3 | 1.860 | 1.860 | 8 |



Philips PW-1051 diffractometer with proportional counter $\mathrm{Cu} \mathrm{K}_{\alpha}$ radiation, and $1^{\circ} / 0$, $1^{\circ} / 1^{\circ}$ divergence, receiving and scatter slits used. Goniometer speed $1 / 8^{\circ} \mathrm{min}$; chart speed $40 \mathrm{~cm} / \mathrm{h}$. Powder samples analysed using a rotating sample holder. (200) reflection of $\mathrm{NaCl}(d=2,8195 \AA)$ used as standard.

## Infrared Spectra

Figure 1 shows infrared spectra of both variscite types between 400 and $4000 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$. The spectra of a pure synthetic metavariscite have been included for comparison. The wave numbers ( $\mathrm{cm}^{-1}$ ) of the most significant bands are given.

The differences in resolution of the spectra are due to the different degree of crystallinity of the samples. Powder diffractograms and petrographic microscopy observations indicate that VL sample is more crystalline than VM.

In OH stretching vibration region ( 2500 to $4000 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ ), the spectra are very similar. The most significant differences between them are in the relative intensities of their bands, especially for those at 3580 and $3100 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$.

The bands of this region indicate the existence of hydrogen bonds of different energy. By considering a linear relationship between distances and infrared stretching frequencies in $\mathrm{O}-\mathrm{H}-\mathrm{O}$ bridges, and taking into account the data of Pimentel and Sederholm (1956), together with the obtained from the metavariscite's structure (Borensztajn, 1966), the observed frequencies indicate variations in $\mathrm{O}-\mathrm{H}-\mathrm{O}$ distances from $2,55 \AA\left(2920 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}\right)$ to $2.70 \AA\left(3340 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}\right)$. The sharp band at $3580 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ represents a distance too long ( $2,9 \AA$ ) to denote the existence of an hydrogen bridge.

In the water deformation region both samples present two wide bands at about 1630 and $1570 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$, indicating the existence of two different types of water molecules $W_{1}$ and $W_{2}{ }^{1}$. If it is assumed that the lowest bending frequency band $\left(1570,1555 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}\right)$ is associated together with the highest stretching one $\left(3580 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}\right)$ to the same water molecules $W_{2}$, these molecules must possess at least one of its two hydrogen atoms not bonded to the structure. On the other hand, $W_{1}$ type (associated to the $1630,1635 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ frequencies) would be bonded to the structure through its two hydrogen atoms.

The relative intensity of the bands at 3580 and near $1570 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ is lower in VM than in VL spectrum. This must be a consequence of the lower proportion of $W_{2}$ water type in the VM structure. Considering the existence of two independent water molecules per asymmetric unit in VL and four in VM (Table 1), the water proportion $W_{1}: W_{2}$ should be 1:1 for "Lucin" variscite against 3:1 for "Messbach" variscite.
$\mathrm{P}-\mathrm{O}$ stretching and bending vibration contribute bands from 1200

[^1]
Spectra obtained with a. Perkin Elmer 225 spectrophotometer. Samples kept for several weeks in a desiccator in presence of silica gel to avoid the presence of extraneous water. Fluorolube mulls used as absorption cells. KBr dises employed in $\mathrm{P}-\mathrm{O}$ vibration region (400 to $1200 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ ).
to $400 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$, which interfere with those due to rotation and translation movements of water molecules; therefore, a complete assignment in this region proves difficult. Adler $(1964,1968)$, studying the $\mathrm{P}-\mathrm{O}$ vibrations on $\mathrm{PO}_{4}{ }^{3-}$ group of natural phosphates, emphasizes the influence of the group symmetry on the number of infrared-active modes. Table 3 shows such a correspondance. According to this scheme both samples present differences in the symmetry of their $\mathrm{PO}_{4}{ }^{3-}$ groups. In fact, while VM spectrum present only two bands at 1145 and 1050 $\mathrm{cm}^{-1}$, assignable to the $\nu_{3}$ mode, VL shows three absorptions at 1150 , 1070 , and $1040 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$. On the other hand, the existence of one unique band at $905 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ in VM spectrum, assignable to the $\nu_{1}$ mode, shows that one at least of the two independent $\mathrm{PO}_{4}{ }^{3-}$ anions of the asymmetric unit must possess $C_{3 v}$ symmetry. Through a similar reasoning, it may be seen that the unique $\mathrm{PO}_{4}{ }^{3-}$ anion of the asymmetric unit in VL structure must possess either $C_{2 v}$ or $C_{s}$ symmetry. ${ }^{1}$

The absence of bands near $2600 \mathrm{~cm}^{-1}$ ( $\mathrm{P}-\mathrm{OH}$ vibrational region), shows, in agreement with Arlidge et al. (1963), that OH structural groups are absent in both structures.

TABLE 3: POSSIBLE MOLECULAR POINE GROUPS AND VIBRATION MODES
FOR THE $\mathrm{FO}_{4}^{-3}$ ION, WHERE $P$ IS ON A $\mathrm{C}_{-1}$ SITE
(FROM ADLER, 1964)

| Molecular Point Group | Number of Infrared Active Vibrations |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $\underline{v}_{3}$ | $\mathrm{v}_{1}$ | $\mathrm{V}_{4}$ | $\underline{-}_{2}$ |
| ${ }^{\text {T }}{ }_{\text {d }}$ | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 |
| $\underline{-}_{2 d}$ | 2 | 0 | 2 | 0 |
| $\mathrm{c}_{3 \mathrm{v}}{ }^{\text {a }}$ | 2 | 1 | 2 | 1 |
| $\mathrm{c}_{\text {25 }}$ | 3 | 1 | 3 | 1 |
| $c^{\text {c }}{ }^{\text {a }}$ | 3 | 1 | 3 | 2 |

${ }^{\text {a }}$ Point groups to which a molecule with a dipole moment might belong.

## Conclusions

Powder X-ray diffraction results seem to indicate that "Messbachtype" variscite, like "Lucin-type", is orthorhombic with space group Pcab. However, the small difference between their X-ray patterns

[^2]involve a change in the unit cell dimensions. Accepting that the VM cell possesses doubled length along the $c$ axis, conserving VL specific gravity, a close structural relationship can be expected between both variscites. Thus, the VL cell might be considered as a VM pseudocell in which both two independent molecules belonging to the asymmetric unit become equivalents. Laueite and Stewartite is an anologous case of polymorphic phosphates $\left[\mathrm{MNFe}_{2}(\mathrm{OH})_{2}\left(\mathrm{PO}_{4}\right)_{2} \cdot 8 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}\right]$, in which the structure of the former is a substructure of the second with period $a / 2$ (Peacor, 1963).

Infrared spectra support the above conclusions showing net differences between both samples: there are two types of water molecules $W_{1}$ and $W_{2} . W_{1}$ possesses its two hydrogen atoms bonded to the structure through $\mathrm{O}-\mathrm{H}-\mathrm{O}$ bridges from 2.55 to $2.70 \AA$, while $W_{2}$ only possess one of them bonded to the structure, the other one being free. The $W_{1}: W_{2}$ proportion is 1:1 for VL against $3: 1$ for VM. No $0-\mathrm{H}$ structural groups are present in both structures. The symmetry of the $\mathrm{PO}_{4}^{-8}$ anion in the VL structure is different from VM.

Summarizing, the results herein seem to confirm the existence of two polymorphic variscite species, "Messbach" and "Lucin" types, closely structurally related. The known fact that "Messbach-type" variscite always occurs in form of cryptocrystalline aggregates, the only single crystals so being of "Lucin-type" (often coexisting with a cryptocrystalline mass of VM), suggests that "Messbach-type" variscite is a metastable crystalline state of the orthorhombic $\mathrm{AlPO}_{4} \cdot 2 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}$, formed under natural conditions which do not allow a greater structural order.

## Acknowledgments

We thank Dr. J. M. Serratosa for help in the interpretation of the infrared spectra and the critical review of the respective part in the manuscript.

## References

Adler, H. H. (1964) Infrared spectra of phosphate minerals: symmetry and substitutional effects in the pyromorphite series. Amer. Mineral. 49, 1002-15. (1968) Infrared spectra of phosphates minerals: splitting and frequency shifts associated with substitution of $\mathrm{PO}_{4}$ for $\mathrm{AsO}_{4}{ }^{3-}$ in mimetite. Amer. Mineral. 53, 1740-44.
Arlidge, E. Z., V. C. Farmer, B. D. Mitchell, and W. A. Mitchell (1963) Infrared, X-ray and thermal analysis of some aluminium and ferric phosphates J. Appl. Chem. 13, 17-27.
Arribas, A., E. Galan, J. M. Martin Pozas, J. Nicolau, and P. Salvador Salvador. (1971) Estudio mineralógico de la variscita de Palazuelo de las Cuevas, Zamora (España). Studia. Geol. (Acta Salmanticensis), 2 (in press).

Borensztajn, J. (1966) Structures cristallines de la métavariscite et de la métastrengite. Bull. Soc. Franc. Minéral. Cristallogr. 89, 428-438.
Cech, F., and E. SLÁnsky (1965) X-ray powder study and thermal investigation of $\mathrm{AlPO}_{4}-2 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ minerals. Acta Univ. Carolinae (Geol) 1, 1-30.
——, AND —— (1968) Infrared spectra of the polymorphs of $\mathrm{AlPO}_{4} \cdot 2 \mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}$. Acta Univ. Carolinae (Geol) 4, 287-294.
Fanfani, L., and P. F. Zanazzi (1966) La struttura cristallina della metastrengita. Acc. Lincei-Sc. Fis. Mat. Nat.-Rendiconti (Roma) 8, 40.
Kyrifama, R., and K. Sakurai (1949) The erystal structure of scorodite. $X$-rays 5, 85.
Moore, P. B. (1966) The crystal structure of metastrengite and its relationship to strengite and phosphophyllite. Amer. Mineral. 51, 168-176.
Palache, C. H., H. Berman and C. Frondel (1944) System of Mineralogy of . . . Dana, 7th ed., 2, 757, John Wiley and Sons, New York.
Peacon, D. R. (1963) The unit cell and space group of stewartite. Amer. Mineral. 48, 913-914.
Pimentel, G. C., and C. H. Sederholm (1956) Correlation of infrared stretching frequencies and hydrogen bond distances in crystals. J. Chem. Phys. 24, 639-41.
Strunz, H. (1957) Mineralogische Tabellen. 3., Leipzig.
Manuscript received, December 31, 1970; accepted for publication, September 21, 1971.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ From the cell constants so obtained ( $a, 9.898 b, 9.663 c, 8.589 \AA$ ), reflections corresponding to $3.74,2.45,2.21,2.18,2.01$, and $1.78 \AA$ interplanar spacings cannot be indexed.

[^1]:    ${ }^{1}$ Two endothermic effects about 185 and $225^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ in their TDA diagrams (Arribas et al., 1971), favor this conclusion.

[^2]:    ${ }^{1}$ Since $V_{4}$ vibration modes do not provide additional information, a more precise assignation is not possible in the absence of data about $V_{2}$ vibrations modes.

